

## **Organizational Variables and Lecturers' Job Retention: Implications on Job Productivity**

Osisami R. Adenike

Lagos State University of Education Oto / Ijanikin with a Campus in  
Noforija Epe

Email: adenikeosisami@yahoo.com

### **Abstract**

*The inadequacy of job retention policies in most public and private universities have been adduced as part of the reasons for the massive brain drain going on in the education sector in recent times. This research examined the influence of some organizational variables on lecturers' job retention and its implications on job productivity. The research adopted the ex post facto research design and used the stratified random sampling technique to select a sample of 935 from a population of 4,392 lectures in public and private universities in Lagos and Ogun States. Five instruments were revalidated and adapted for the study and the analysis of data was done using multiple regression and Pearson Products Moment Correlation on three hypotheses tested at 0.05 level of significance. The results revealed that the three null hypotheses were rejected. Thus, the composite and relative contributions of the organizational variables; participatory management, performance appraisal and organizational commitment to job retention were seen to have high potency. Based on the findings, universities are advised to strengthen these organizational variables in order to improve job productivity as well as reduce the incidence of brain drain.*

*Keywords:* job productivity, job retention, participatory management, performance appraisal, organizational commitment

The fear of rationalization, retrenchment, or retirement; a dearth of comprehensive collections of current books and journals in libraries; a dearth of lively seminars; a dearth of research grants; an excessive workload; a dearth of input in decision-making; a desire for new challenges; and a lack of functional laboratories are just a few organizational factors that have been linked to poor retention of lecturers by many researchers (Mayer, 2006; Metcalf et al., 2005; Ologunde et al., 2006; Strebler et al., 2006). According to Metcalf et al.'s (2005) research, academics' biggest concern when deciding whether to leave their jobs was workload, while income was their least important consideration. Mihyo (2007) correctly points out that the problem frequently goes unnoticed because it is lumped into the broad category of brain drain. Retaining academic staff on their job is an arduous task for universities. The problem of lecturers' job retention is seriously threatening Nigerian universities in recent time, and Tettey (2006) corroborates this by citing Obasi (2002) who states that all federal universities in Nigeria, with the exception of one, have only half of their teaching staff complement on duty, with some recording understaffing rates of up to 70%. This situation comes with other outcomes such as low productivity

on the job, in other words, apart from the staff retention issue; organizations such as the university system are faced with staff productivity challenges. There is an evolving competitive atmosphere among universities in Nigeria with the participation of government, private organisations and individuals in the establishment of this level of education, which is particularly pronounced in Lagos State with a large number of private universities. As a result of this, the problem of lecturers' job retention therefore poses a challenge to university management on how to retain and improve the productivity of their lecturers.

### **Objectives of the Study**

The study sought to establish the influence of organizational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment on university lecturers' job retention. The objectives are clearly stated as, to:

1. Determine the extent to which organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance will compositely influence lecturers' job retention.
2. Determine the extent to which organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance will relatively influence lecturers' job retention.
3. Determine the extent to which organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment will compositely predict male lecturers' job retention.
4. Determine the extent to which organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment will compositely predict female lecturers' job retention.

### **Research Hypotheses**

Four hypotheses in the study were tested at 0.05 level of significance.

- H<sub>01</sub>: There is no significant composite contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance on lecturers' job retention.
- H<sub>02</sub>: There is no significant relative contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance on lecturers' job retention.
- H<sub>03</sub>: There is no significant composite contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment on male lecturers' job retention.
- H<sub>04</sub>: There is no significant composite contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment on female lecturers' job retention.

The study is delimited to ten universities in Lagos and Ogun States comprising two federal, three state and five private universities in all. The choice of Lagos and Ogun states for the study was because Ogun state has the

highest number of universities in the nation and Lagos being a cosmopolitan city is also following closely in this regard. The private universities included in the study have been defined based on the year of establishment and this study included only the ones that had been in existence as at 2005. This is hinged on the fact that most of the fourth-generation universities, all private, are struggling to find their feet in terms of human and non-human resources availability. Another factor of consideration necessitating the definition of participation in the research is the dependent variable – job retention, which has been defined as involving universities existing as at 2005 (that is, the universities that have been existing for ten years or more). It is the researcher's belief that such universities would have attained internal stability within this period. Lecturers of varied academic backgrounds and disciplines, statuses, and gender were randomly selected from the universities. The study would examine the influence of organizational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on university lecturers' job retention and the implication this has on job productivity of lecturers in Lagos and Ogun States Nigeria.

### **Review of Literature**

#### **Concept of Job Retention**

When attempting to identify the origins of the concept of employee retention, Mckeown (2002) notes that it first became common in the 1970s and early 1980s because, up until that point, most people joined organizations and stayed for a very long time, sometimes for the entirety of their working lives. However, as employment mobility and voluntarily changing jobs increased, businesses began to face the issue of employee turnover, and employee retention as a management tool started to be developed as a solution.

Employee retention refers to the methods, strategies, or collection of behaviours implemented by firms to keep their capable staff for performance (Gberevbie, 2008). In other words, employee retention refers to a variety of rules and procedures that encourage staff members to stay with a company for an extended period of time. To train a new hire, make him corporate ready, and bring him up to par with the existing staff, every firm invests time and money. Once personnel are properly trained, they leave their jobs, leaving the company completely at a loss. The numerous steps done to ensure that a person stays with a company for the longest possible time are considered in the employee retention process. As a result, retention is now understood to mean the capacity to maintain those personnel you wish to keep for longer than your rivals (Madiha et al., 2009). Due to the lack of trained labour, economic expansion, and significant employee turnover, one of the most important problems organizational managers face is staff retention (Michael, 2008). Based on this, the primary goal of retention is to keep qualified people within the company, as not doing so could have a negative impact on productivity and service delivery (Chiboiwa et al., 2010). Retention is seen as a complex element of a company's human resource policies. To keep them engaged and committed to the

organization, it starts with the hiring of the proper people and continues with a working agenda (Freyermuth, 2007 cited in Madiha et al., 2009).

Finding and keeping committed personnel for as long as it is advantageous to both the organization and the employee is one of the goals of retention policies (Sutherland, 2004). For the benefit of the organizations, several human resource methods have been offered to keep people on board. These tactics are focused at reducing employee turnover. In order to compete favourably and actually obtain a competitive advantage over others, universities rely on the expertise, knowledge, skills, financial resources, and capacity development of their academic and non-academic staff.

Recent research has revealed that it is becoming increasingly challenging for managers to retain highly trained workers because multiple organizations are competing for their attention at the same time with various forms of incentives (Michael, 2008). In order to develop retention methods and structures for their current core personnel in these modern firms, management must develop an enabling and sustainable critical culture and strategy. This is important because, according to Czkan (2005), critically competent and mobile people can no longer be motivated to stay by historical retention tactics that were utilized to achieve retention.

Additionally, retention enables senior and line managers to successfully recruit and hold on to key talented and top performers (Michael, 2008). In an effort to address staff retention issues in both public and private colleges, Mapolisa (2014) proposed in a study that staff members themselves be involved in staff retention as a synergistic solution. He added that improving staff retention in both public and private institutions can be achieved by forming partnerships with other colleges and organizations.

### **Relationship Between Job Retention and Job Productivity**

The literature confirms the link between productivity and job retention. According to the research of Ogunyemi (2007), Michael (2008), and Adenuga et al. (2013), employees' productivity, increased commitment, and intention to remain in the company are all influenced by their working conditions, job satisfaction, opportunities for advancement, and recognition for advancement.

According to Bigambo (2004), reported in Odinga (2010), the recent implementation of performance contracts mandates that staff productivity be evaluated annually on both teaching excellence and research production. Academic personnel are under pressure to succeed and raise the universities' standing in the world of academia as a result of rising challenges like employee turnover and brain drain. Each member of the academic staff must therefore demonstrate their reliability in order to maintain their job with the university. This is done by demonstrating the scope and quality of their research, teaching, and consulting activities, among other skills. Job performance has been a contentious issue in the majority of nations due to weak work ethics that have progressively formed and inadequate departmental coordination, among other causes (Odinga, 2010). Because skilled employees produce high morale and

satisfied co-workers who will deliver better customer service and increased productivity, keeping them on board is advantageous to any organization in gaining a competitive advantage that cannot be matched by other rivals (Hong et al., 2012).

Meanwhile, Kresiman (2002) concurred that problems with organizational commitment, productivity, and retention are now the biggest obstacles to effective staff management. He concurs that the loss of staff members can have a big impact on how business strategies are carried out and may eventually result in a parallel drop in productivity. The aforementioned emphasizes the significance of this study, which is a significant concern facing the academic system today. The productivity and retention of lecturers at their jobs have been found to be correlated with favourable working conditions, job satisfaction, organizational commitment, opportunities for advancement, recognition for advancement, and a good economic reward system, as well as participatory management, personal and professional development, performance evaluation, flexible working hours, and additional time for research activities (Adenuga et al., 2013; Bernard, 2012; Naris & Ukpere, 2010). These studies affirmed that people would work more willingly and better, if their working conditions are agreeable with their psychological attachment to their work and the intention to stay in the organization.

#### **Participatory Management, Performance Appraisal System, and Organisational Commitment**

In a study on *'Influence of Leadership Style on Academic Staff Retention in Public Universities in Kenya'* by Ng'ethe et al. (2012), it was found that 65% agreed that leadership contributes to the overall effectiveness of the organization which includes ability to retain staff. This supports the argument that leaders have a pivotal role to play in staff retention. On average, 56.4% participants indicated that the leadership in their institutions did not respond to staff issues promptly and a significant percentage (46.9%) disagreed that staff were involved in decision making compared to 33.1% who agreed that staff were involved. Further a significant number (46.3%) disagreed that the leaders communicated regularly on matters important to them against (31.7%) who agreed that there was regular communication. In addition, 56% indicated that the leadership style commonly practised in their institutions was autocratic. Reporting on job retention, Selesho and Naile (2014) carried out a study on academic staff retention as a human resource factor: university perspective, in a survey involving 80 academic staff lecturing at the selected institutions and the survey discovered job satisfaction as the main factor keeping academic staff in their profession. The study could not rule out the probabilities of working conditions as a factor influencing retention. Academic staff felt that salaries, academic promotion, and development were the main aspects and with regard to these factors, the respondents felt that their expectations were not met. Amongst other elements, salary disparities were also identified as one of the main reasons causing academics to leave their profession.

Likewise, a study by Hussain and Rehman (2013) examined human resource management practices which include; training and development, development of teams, performance appraisal, internal communication system, employment security, person-organization fit, employee empowerment, reward, and compensation on 303 respondents. They found that five human resource management practices: person-organization fit, employment security, communication, performance appraisal and training and development contributed strongly (adjusted  $R^2 = 0.782$ ) in determining employees' intentions to stay with organization and concluded that a strong positive inter-relationship was found between human resource management practices and employees' retention.

### **Organizational Commitment and Job Retention**

An empirical investigation on the relationship between organizational commitment and job satisfaction found significant differences in organizational commitment between public and private colleges. In a study by Adekola (2012), which included 150 academic, administrative, and technical staff members from both public and private universities in Nigeria, it was discovered that staff members in the public sector have a higher level of organizational commitment than staff members in the private sector (mean = 38.96 vs. 23.74).

According to Uludag et al.'s (2011) study on the influences of organizational commitment, citizenship behaviour, and turnover intentions, job satisfaction is positively correlated with organizational citizenship behaviour and negatively correlated with intentions to leave. It was discovered that organizational citizenship behaviour was favourably correlated with affective organizational commitment. Additionally, it was observed that there was no connection between organizational dedication and intents to leave.

In their findings, Khan et al. (2013), who examined the effects of organizational commitment and job satisfaction in the ITL of academics at HEIs in developing nations like Pakistan, concluded that both factors have a significant impact on the intention to leave. They proposed that academicians' job happiness increases their level of commitment, which in turn reduces their intention to leave the educational institution. Academics will be more productive and dedicated the more satisfied they are.

### **Gender and Job Retention**

An empirical study that is connected to gender and job retention is that of Hundera (2014) on the variables influencing academic staff turnover intentions and the moderating effect of gender, which involved 112 respondents and had a 75% response rate. Female academic staff employees are more likely to abandon their employment and experience higher levels of role stress, per the report. Role stress affected female employees' work satisfaction and intention to leave the company more than it affected male employees. Both male and female academic staff members' commitment was found to be strongly influenced by overall satisfaction, but the effect on female academic staff members was

stronger, accounting for 57.44% and 23.79%, respectively, of the variance in intentions to leave the profession.

### Research Methodology

#### Research Design

In this study, the descriptive research design was used. The study employed multi-stage sampling approach. The sample consisted of 1,026 Lecturers randomly selected from federal, state and private universities established at least not later than 2005 in Lagos and Ogun states. First, the researcher selected the institutions using stratified random sampling technique which entails classifying the institutions into three categories of federal, state and private. Second, with the population of each university defined, the sample size for the study was drawn using 25% proportional sampling technique and simple random sampling with due consideration of each university's academic staff strength. The 25% proportional sampling technique trickled down on the samples picked in each faculty and department. The academic cadres and gender representation based on 25% proportional technique was considered as well. Although, the number of questionnaires returned was 1,026, some were not properly filled. Hence, the number found to be properly filled was 935 which was used for the analysis. The demographic data inventory and five adopted instruments were used to sieve information from respondents. The instruments are; Performance Appraisal System Scale for Lecturers (PASSL), Participatory Management Scale for Lecturers (PMSL), Organizational Commitment Scale for Lecturers (OCSL), Job Productivity Scale for Lecturers (JPSL), Job Retention Scale for Lecturers (JRSL). The research instruments were subjected to face and content validity. A test re-test technique was used to determine the reliability co-efficient of the instrument at 0.05 degree of significance. Descriptive statistics such as Mean and Standard Deviation were used to describe the sample and the data. The postulated null hypotheses were tested using Canonical analysis and were tested for significance at 0.05 level.

### Presentation of Results

**H<sub>01</sub>:** There is no significant composite contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance on lecturers' job retention.

Table 1

*Tests of Significance for Job Retention using Canonical Regression with Unique Sums of Squares*

Source of Variation	SS	DF	MS	F	Sig of F
Within cells	116868.23	927	130.43		
Regression	48831.96	3	16277.32	124.79	.000
Constant	33438.11	1	33438.11	256.36	.000
(Corrected Model)	48831.96	3	16277.32	124.79	.000
(Corrected Total)	165700.19	934	184.32		

R-Squared = .295; Adjusted R-Squared = .292

Table 1 shows the regression model summary for the joint contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States. The result indicates that there is a significant contribution of organisational variables on lecturers' job retention ( $F_{3, 934} = 124.79$ ;  $p < .05$ ). Therefore, the postulated null hypothesis one is rejected. This means that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment jointly contributed to lecturers' job retention.

Moreover, the Adjusted R-Squared value indicates that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment jointly contributed 29.2% to the variance in lecturers' job retention in Lagos and Ogun State universities. Other factors that might contribute to the remaining 70.8% variance in lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States are beyond the scope of this study.

### Hypothesis Two

**H<sub>02</sub>:** There is no significant relative contribution of organisational variables such as participatory management, performance appraisal and organisational commitment performance on lecturers' job retention.

Table 2

*Relative Contribution of Participatory Management, Performance Appraisal System and Organisational Commitment to Lecturers' Job Retention*

COVA RIATE	B	Beta	Std. Err.	t-Value	Sig.	Lower -95%	CL- Upper
PAS	.07940307	.19799023	.01348	5.88898	.000	.05294	.10587
PM	.11161173	.10249303	.03631	3.07408	.002	.04035	.18287
OC	.33363982	.40480329	.02406	13.86958	.000	.28643	.38085

Note. PAS= Performance Appraisal System; PM= Participatory Management;  
OC= Organizational Commitment

Table 2 shows the regression (canonical) analysis for within cells error term on Job Retention. It further reveals the relative contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States, Nigeria. From the statistical results, the standardized regression weight associated with performance appraisal system ( $\beta = .198$ ), participatory management ( $\beta = .102$ ) and organisational commitment ( $\beta = .405$ ) are each significant at .05 level. The value of the standardized regression weights reveals that organisational commitment has the most potent contribution to lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States, ( $\beta = .405$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .286 to .381) followed by lecturers' performance appraisal system, ( $\beta = .198$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .053 to .106). Participatory management contributes least to lecturers' job retention in Lagos and Ogun State universities, ( $\beta = .102$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .040 to .183). Relative contributions to variation in Lecturers' job retention are



further illustrated in Table 10 depicting squared correlations between the covariates and the dependent variable job retention.

Table 3

*Squared Correlations between Covariates and Predicted Job Retention*

VARIABLES	AVER. R-SQ
Performance Appraisal System	.43042
Participatory Management	.30180
Organizational Commitment	.77630

Table 3 reveals that 77.6% of the variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in organisational commitment, 43.0% of the variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in performance appraisal system in the universities and only 30.2% of the variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in participatory involvement of academic staff in university management.

**Hypothesis Three**

**H<sub>03</sub>:** There is no significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on male lecturers' job retention.

Table 4

*Regression Analysis Model for the Composite Contribution of Participatory Management, Performance Appraisal System and Organisational Commitment on Male Lecturers' Job Retention*

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regression	32302.957	3	10767.652	85.198	.000
Residual	73682.113	610	126.384		
Total	105985.070	613			

*Note.* N = 614, R = .552, R<sup>2</sup> = .305, Adj. R<sup>2</sup> = .301

Table 4 shows the composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on male lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States of Nigeria. The combined regression analysis model established that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment had a statistically significant combined contribution on male lecturers' job retention,  $F_{(3,614)} = 85.198$ ,  $p < .05$ . The regression model further indicated that the multiple correlation coefficient,  $R = .589$  while the adjusted  $R^2 = .301$ . This suggests that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment significantly contributed to job retention of male lecturers and accounted for 30.1% of the explained variance in male lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States.

### Hypothesis Four

**H<sub>04</sub>:** There is no significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on female lecturers' job retention.

Table 5

*Regression Analysis Model for the Composite Contribution of Participatory Management, Performance Appraisal System and Organisational Commitment on Female Lecturers' Job Retention*

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regression	17129.475	3	5709.825	41.251	.000
Residual	41109.535	317	138.416		
Total	58239.010	320			

*Note.* N = 321, R = .542, R<sup>2</sup> = .294, Adj. R<sup>2</sup> = .287

Table 5 shows the composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment on female lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States, Nigeria. The combined regression analysis model established that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organisational commitment had a statistically significant combined contribution on female lecturers' job retention,  $F_{(3,321)} = 41.251$ ,  $p < .05$ . The regression model further indicated the multiple correlation coefficient,  $R = .542$  while the adjusted  $R^2 = .287$ . This means that participatory management; performance appraisal system and organisational commitment significantly contributed to job retention of female lecturers and accounted for 28.7% of the explained variance in female lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States.

### Discussion of Results

The major findings of this study are highlighted below;

The first hypothesis stated that there is no significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention. The result of the research negates the null hypothesis and indicates that there is a significant combined contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention.

Thus, this is stating that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment jointly contributed to lecturers' job retention. All the variables accounted for 29.2% of the variance in the job retention of university lecturers, while the remaining 70.8% variance on lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun states could not be explained by the current data. It is assumed that other factors might be responsible for the large percentage of variance. The implication is that in a country like Nigeria where the attracting force to taking lecturing job is the pay

package, good working condition, and autonomy among others, the quest for these may put pressure on lecturers' job retention.

The result agreed with the findings reported by Waswa and Katana (2008) that academic staff participation in decision-making is low and if such is left unattended to it may influence them to leave. Also, this study agreed with the findings of Selesho and Naile (2014), which reported that job satisfaction, working condition, salaries disparities, academic promotion and development are some of the main reasons causing academics to leave their profession.

Likewise, this result concurred with the findings of Hong et al. (2012) who revealed that appraisal system is significant to employees' retention. Their findings showed that there is a significantly positive relationship between independent variable; performance appraisal and dependent variable; retention. The findings further agreed with Gbadamosi and Nwosu (2011) that employees who are committed to the organization will remain loyal and are inversely related to turnover.

The work of Uludag et al. (2011) disagreed with this finding. Reporting on the effects of job satisfaction, organizational commitment and organizational citizenship behaviour on turnover intentions, they revealed that there was no significant relationship between organizational commitment and turnover intentions.

On the second hypothesis which proposed that there is no significant relative contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States. The result of the research negates the null hypothesis. The result indicates that there is a significant relative contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention. That is, all the independent variables were found to contribute relatively to lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States, at .05 level of significance. Surprisingly, organizational commitment had the most potent contribution ( $\beta = .405$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .286 to .381) followed by performance appraisal system ( $\beta = .198$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .053 to .106) and participatory management ( $\beta = .102$ ;  $p < .05$ ; CI, .040 to .183) contributing the least to lecturers' job retention in Lagos and Ogun State Universities. The empirical analysis further revealed that 77.6% of the variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in organizational commitment, 43.0% of the variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in performance appraisal system and 30.2% of variation in lecturers' job retention is explained by the variation in participatory management. The reasons for this could be based on the fact that organizational commitment is a reflection of the state of affairs in an organization in terms of the willingness of employees to remain with an organization on the ground of job satisfaction which includes monetary and non-monetary rewards. By implication, this is suggesting that when job commitment is enhanced it will positively affect lecturers' job retention.

This research finding is in consonance with Khan et al. (2013), who working on the impact of organizational commitment and job satisfaction on the ITL of Academicians in HEIs of developing countries like Pakistan submitted in their findings that both the organizational commitment and job satisfaction have significant impact on intention to leave. They posited that academicians' satisfaction with the job enhances the commitment level and hence the intention to quit the educational institution decreases. The more academicians are satisfied; they will be productive and more committed.

The findings above further corroborate the findings of Hong et al. (2012) when they carried out an empirical study on effectiveness of human resource management practices on employee retention and revealed that appraisal system is significant to employees' retention. Their findings showed that there is significant positive relationship between independent variable performance appraisal and dependent variable, retention. The findings of this research also lend credence to the work of Hussain and Rehman (2013) who submitted that of the human resource management practices packaged as independent variables in a research, person-organization fit, employment security, communication, performance appraisal and training and development contributed strongly in determining employees' intention to stay with the organization. The finding disagrees with the result of Janjua and Gulzar (2014) where they submitted that there was no significant relation between fair performance appraisal and employee retention.

The third hypothesis stated that there is no significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on the male lecturers' job retention. The result of this research negates this hypothesis, as it reflected that there is a significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on job retention of male lecturers in universities in Lagos and Ogun states.

The combined regression analysis established that participatory management, performance appraisal system, and organizational commitment had a statistically significant combined contribution on male lecturers' job retention, with these contributing 30.1% of the explained variance in male lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun states. This implies that the combination of these independent variables would influence male lecturers' job retention in Lagos and Ogun states. This result contradicts the findings of Hundera (2014) when he worked on factors affecting academic staff turnover intentions and observing the effect of gender, he reported that the effect of overall satisfaction and intention to leave was higher among female academic staff.

The fourth hypothesis stated that there is no significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on female lecturers' job retention.

The result of the research runs contrary to the null hypothesis. The finding reflected that there is a significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment on female lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States.

The regression analysis established that participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment had a statistically significant combined contribution on female lecturers' job retention ( $R=.542$ ;  $R^2 = .287$ ;  $F_{(3,300)} = 41.251$ ,  $p < .05$ ) by contributing 28.7% of the explained variance in female lecturers' job retention in universities in Lagos and Ogun States. This implies that all the three independent variables could together influence female lecturers' job retention. This finding disagreed with the result of Hundera (2014) where he reported that the effect of overall satisfaction and intention to leave was higher among female academic staff.

### **Conclusion**

Lecturers' job retention and productivity could be improved when attention is given to human resources variables or indicators such as a participatory management, performance appraisal system and organizational commitment. Although, the independent variables are seen from the study to have greater influence on lecturers' job retention. Based on the findings gathered in this research, it could be submitted that organizational commitment has greater influence on lecturers' job retention. Thus, strengthening these factors in our universities would improve lecturers' job satisfaction, leading to improved job retention and productivity.

As well, the findings revealed that there is significant composite and relative contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal and organizational commitment on university lecturers' job retention. The research findings established that there is a significant composite contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention; although, the relative contribution of the independent variables on lecturers' job retention revealed that organizational commitment was more potent, followed by performance appraisal and then participatory management.

In addition, the findings exposed that there was a significant contribution of participatory management, performance appraisal and organizational commitment on lecturers' job retention and productivity with the moderating effect of gender and university type. The results indicated that the influence of participatory management, performance appraisal and organizational commitment is more visible on male lecturers' job retention compared to the female lecturers. It would be inferred that university lecturers who experience fair performance appraisal, good organizational commitment and participative involvement in decision making would most likely intend to stay on the job and be productive.

### Recommendations

The following recommendations are suggested to help improve lecturers' job retention and its implication on their job productivity.

University management should involve academic staff in decision-making; this will enable them to voice out their opinions on policies and goals of the organization, thereby preventing issues from escalating to industrial action or disengagement from universities. Encouraging participatory management in the universities will enable the management to identify issues affecting academic staff and thus, provide timely intervention which will promote staff retention and productivity.

University management and human resource department need to ensure that the performance appraisal system of the academic staff is developed on the principles of objectivity, allowing for inputs from lecturers in the construction of such appraisal instruments. Universities should endeavour to run a fair performance appraisal system, in order to encourage lecturers' retention decision.

Organizational commitment as identified in the study is significant to lecturers' job retention. It is therefore, emphasized that university administrators (both public and private) take into cognizance the working conditions of lecturers especially as it affects training and development, office facilities and compensation packages.

In order for university management to manage their institutions effectively, periodic evaluation of the administrative practices in the institution should be carried out. This would help them to assess what lecturers want and what factors are hindering their effectiveness on the job.

University management could endorse different exchange programmes to facilitate participation of lecturers from other institutions in their activities. This could be a strategy in ensuring that lecturers see no reasons in changing jobs, they get committed and increase their intention to stay and be productive.

### References

- Academic Staff Union of University. (2013). ASUU strike continues until agreement is implemented. <http://feathersproject.word.com/tag/academic-staff/union.universities-asuu/>
- Adekola, B. (2012). The impact of organisational commitment on job satisfaction: A study of employees at Nigerian Universities. *International Journal of Human Resources Studies*, 2(2), 21-35.
- Adenuga, R. A., Adenuga, F. T., & Ayodele, K. O. (2013). Organizational commitment and turnover intention among private universities' employees in Ogun State, Nigeria. *Open Journal of Education*, 1(2), 31-36. <http://dx.doi.org/10.12966/oje>
- Adeyemo, D. A. & Aremu, A. O. (1999). Career commitment among secondary school teachers in Oyo state, Nigeria: The role of biographical mediators. *Nigerian Journal of Applied Psychology*, 5(2), 184-194.

- Beardwell, J., & Claydon, J. (2007). *Human resource management: A contemporary approach* (5th ed.) Great Britain, Pearson Education Limited.
- Bernard, B. (2012). Factors that determine academic staff retention and commitment in private tertiary institution in Botswana: Empirical Review. *Global Advanced Research Journal of Management and Business Studies*, 1(19), 278-299. <http://garj.org/garjbb/index.htm>
- Bernard, B., Oscar, C., & Morgan, C. (2012). The impact of academic staff recruitment, development and retention policies at Ba Isago University College on their commitment to the college. *A Research Journal of Business Management and Accounting*, 1(4), 84-97.
- Bett, M. (1999). *Independent review of higher education pay and conditions*. Norwich: stationery office.
- Bigambo, O. (2004). *Investigation of the output of Moi University academic staff: Challenges and dilemma of trained and untrained teachers*. A paper presented during the 3<sup>rd</sup> Annual International Conference. Kenya, Moi University.
- Cargile, B. R., & Bubilitz, B. (1986). Factors contributing to published research by accounting facilities: *The Accounting Review*, 158-178.
- Chew, J. C. (2004). The influence of human resource management practices on the retention of core employees of Australian organisations [PhD Thesis]. Murdoch University.
- Chiboiwa, W. M., Samuel, M. O., & Chipunza, J. (2010). An examination of employee retention strategy in a private organisation in Zimbabwe: *African Journal of Business Management*, 4(10), 2103- 2109.
- Court, S. (1999). Negotiating the research imperative: The views of academics on their career opportunities. *Higher Education Quart*, 53(1), 65-87.
- Czkan, T. (2005). Talent scouting: The dynamics of top talent. *Journal of the South African Institute of People Management*, 23(3), 8-9.
- Daly, C. J., & Dee, J. R. (2006). Greener pastures: Faculty turnover intent in urban public Universities. *Journal of Higher Education*, 7(9), 59-64.
- Dockel, A. (2003). The effect of retention factors on organizational commitment: An investigation of high technology employees [*Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation*]. University of Pretoria, South Africa.
- Freyermuth. (2007). Retaining employees in a tightening labour market, RSM McGladrey. [www.cfo.com/whitepapers/index.cfm/displayw](http://www.cfo.com/whitepapers/index.cfm/displayw).
- Gberevbie, D. E. I. (2008). Recruitment and quality academic staff selection: The case study of Covenant University. *Ife Psychologia*, 14(2), 118-127.
- Gede, N. T., & Lawanson, O. A. (2011). Employees' characteristics and job performance of staff of the Bayelsa State Ministry of Education. *Proceedings of the 2011 International Conference on Teaching, Learning and Change*.

- Griffith, J. (2004). Relation of principal transformational leadership to school staff job satisfaction, staff turnover, and school performance. *Educational Administration*, 42(3), 333-356. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/09578230410534667>.
- Gwavuya, F. (2011). Leadership influences on turnover intentions of academic staff in institutions in Zimbabwe. *Academic Leadership Journal*, 9(1), 46-56. Harlow, Pearson Education Ltd.
- Hsu, M. K., Jiang, J. J., Klein, G., & Tang, Z. (2003). Perceived career incentives and intent to leave. *Information and Management Journal*, 40, 361-369. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S03787206\(02\)000186](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S03787206(02)000186)<http://dx.doi.org/10.5465/AME.2001.5897929>.
- Hundera, M. B. (2014). Factors affecting academic staff turnover intentions and the moderating effect of research in business management, 2(9), 57-70.
- Hussein, T., & Rehman, S. (2013). Do human resources management practice inspire employee's retention? *Research Journal of Applied Sciences, Engineering and technology*, 6(19), Maxwell scientific organizational publisher.
- Khan, A. (2012). Performance appraisal's relation with productivity and job satisfaction. *Journal of Managerial Sciences*, 1(2), 99-114. Publisher department of management sciences Qurtuba University of science and IT, Pakistan.
- Khan, I., Nawaz, A., Khan, F., Khan, H., Khan., S., & Kundi, A. (2013). The impact of organizational commitment and job satisfaction on the ITL of academicians in HEIs of developing countries like Pakistan. *Industrial Engineering Letters*, 9.
- Khan, M. R., Ziauddin, F. A., & Ramay, M. I. (2010). The impact of organisational commitment on employee job performance. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 15(3), 1-7.
- Kira, M., Eijnatten, F. M. V., & Balkin, D. B. (2010). Crafting sustainable work: Development of personal resources. *Organizational Change Management*, 23(5), -632.
- Leibowitz, Z. B., Farren, C., & Kaye, B. L. (1986). Designing career development systems. San Francisco, CA: Jossey- Bass Publishers.
- Madiha, S., Noor, A., & Tirmzi, S. R. (2009). Determinant of employee retention in telecom sector of Pakistan. *Bi Lahore, Pakistan*.
- Mapolisa, T. (2014). Mitigating staff challenges in public and private universities in Kenya. *Journal of Educational Policy and Entrepreneurial Research*, 1(4), 140-150.
- McKeown, L. J. (2002). *Retaining top employees*. USA: McGraw-Hill Companies.
- Mehta, M., Kurbetti, A., & Dhankhar, R. (2014). Review paper on employee retention and commitment. *International Journal of Academic Research*



- in Computer Science and Management Studies*, 2(2). Retrieved from [www.ijarcsms.com](http://www.ijarcsms.com)
- Michael, S.O. (2008). Using motivational strategy as panacea for employee retention and turnover in selected public and private sector organisations in the Eastern Cape Province of South Africa. *Master of Commerce Thesis*, University of Fort Hare.
- Mihyo, B.P. (2007). Staff retention in African universities and links with diaspora study. *Report on working group on Higher Education*, Windhoek.
- Miller, Y. (2010). Labour turnover and its impact on customer service and success of restaurants in London. <http://www.articleblast.com>
- Milory, G. (2004). Sense of place in the workplace: The relationship between personal objects and job satisfaction and motivation. *Journal of Interior Design*, 27(1), 35-44.
- Mitchell, T. R., Holtom, B. C., & Lee, T. W. (2001). How to keep your best employees: Developing an effective retention policy. *Academy of Management Executive*, 15(4), 96-109.
- Mobley, W. H. (2004). Employee turnover: causes, consequences and control. Reading, London: Addison-Wesley Publishing.
- Muindi, F. K. (2011). The relationship between participation in decision making and job satisfaction among academic staff in the school of business University of Nairobi. *Journal of Human Resources Management Research*, 1-34. <http://www.ibimapublishing.com/journal/jhrmr.html>
- Nabavi, M. (2011). *Participatory management in Islamic sciences*. Farvardin Press 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition Tehran.
- Naris, N. S., & Ukpere, W. (2010). Developing a retention strategy for qualified staff at the polytechnic of Namibia. *In African Journal of Business Management*, 4(6) 1078 -1084.
- Ng'ethe, J. M., Iravo, M.E., & Namusonge, G. S. (2012). Determinants of academic staff retention in public universities in Kenya: Empirical review. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 2(13), 205-212.
- Odinga, M.J. (2010). Staff development programs and job performance of lecturers of MOI University. *Unpublished Masters Project in Higher Education Studies* of Makerere University Kampala. 1- 128.
- Ogini, B. O., Ogunlesi, C. F., & Faseyiku, I. O. (2013). A study of employee retention strategies and organizational survival in private universities in South West, Nigeria. *Journal of Management*, 2(1), 1-17. [www.theijm.com](http://www.theijm.com)
- Ogunyemi, A. O. (2007). Perceived leadership style, motivation and training as predictors of workers' productivity in a manufacturing industry in Lagos State, Nigeria. *Journal of Counselling Studies*, (1), 76-83.
- Olmstead, M. A. (1993). Mentoring new faculty: Advice to department chairs. *CSWP Gazette*, 13(1). <http://faculty.washington.edu/olmstd/research/>

- Ologunde, A. O., Asaolu, T. O., & Elumilade, D. O. (2006). Motivation and labour turnover among university teachers in southwest Nigeria. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(1), 1-14.
- Parrill, S. (1999). *Revisiting rating format research: computer-based rating formats and components of accuracy* [Unpublished Manuscript]. Virginia Polytechnic and State Institute, Blacksburg, VA.
- Prince, B. J. (2005). Career-focused employee transfer processes. *Career Development International*, 10(4), 293-309.
- Rahman, K. (2012). An effectiveness of human resource management practices on employee retention in Institute of higher learning: *A Regression Analysis International Journal of Business Resources Management*, 3(2), 65-70.
- Robbins, S. P. (2003). *Organizational behaviour* (10th ed.). New Jersey: Prentice Hall, Inc.
- Safari, T., Othman, A., Nubli, M., & Wahab, A. (2012). Gender, academic rank, employment status, university type and job stress among the university academic staff: a comparison between Malaysia and Indonesia context. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 1(18), 250-261. [www.ijhssnet.com](http://www.ijhssnet.com)
- Sherman, A., Alper, W., & Wolfson, A. (2006). *The retention dilemma*. <http://www.prweb.com/releases/2006/prweb399230.htm>
- Shoaib, M., Noor, A., Tirmizi, S., & Bashir, S. (2009). *Determinants of employee retention in telecom sector of Pakistan*. Proceedings 2nd CBRC, Lahore, Pakistan.
- Strebler, M., Pollard, E., Miller, L., & Akroyd, K. (2006). Recruitment and retention of staff in higher education. *Universities and Colleges Employers Association*.
- Sutherland, M. M. (2004). Factors affecting the retention of knowledge workers. *Published PhD Thesis*. Rand Afrikaans University.
- Taylor, C. R. (2004). Retention leadership. *T+D*, 58(3), 41-45.
- Tetty, J. W. (2006). *Staff retention in African universities: elements of a sustainable strategy*. Washington DC: World Bank [http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTAFRRETOTEIA/Resources/AcademicRetention\\_Final\\_pdf.on](http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTAFRRETOTEIA/Resources/AcademicRetention_Final_pdf.on)
- Tetty, J. W. (2009). Deficits in academic staff capacity in Africa and challenges of developing and retaining the next generation of academics. *Partnership for Higher Education in Africa*.
- Uludag, O., Khan, S., & Guden, N. (2011). The effects of job satisfactory organizational commitment, organizational citizenship behaviour on turnover intention in Florida. *International University Review*, 29(2), 1-21.
- Wells, M., & Thelen, L. (2002). What does your work place say about you? The influence of personality, status and workplace on personalization. *Environmental and Behaviour*, 34(3), 300-321.